Greater Heretaunga and Ahuriri Land and Water Management Collaborative Stakeholder (TANK) Group





Karakia



Agenda

10:00am Welcome, karakia, notices, meeting record

- **10:15am** Tutaekuri locality of values
- **10:30am** Ngaruroro and Tutaekuri attributes states

12:30pm LUNCH

- 1:15pmContinued....
- **2:30pm** Waitangi Estuary freshwater influences
- **3:00pm COFFEE BREAK**
- 3:15pm Updates on: Working Groups, Water Conservation Order, Bayesian Belief Network (BBN) work and RPC meeting
- 3:45pm TANK Information Portal
- **3:50pm** Agenda setting for next meeting

~4:00pm FINISH



Meeting objectives

- 1. Continue to make choices for attribute states in:
 - the Ngaruroro River
 - Ngaruroro River tributaries
- 2. Confirm values for the Tutaekuri catchment
- 3. Understand current state and make choices for attribute states for the Tutaekuri River
- 4. Understand estuary state in relation to freshwater inputs



Action points

ID	Action item	Person responsible	Status
21.1	Provide a link on the portal to the Next Steps for Freshwater summary of submissions. <u>http://www.mfe.govt.nz/sites/default/files/media/Fresh%20water/summary-of-</u> <u>submissions-next-steps-for-freshwater-final-3.pdf</u>	Desiree	Completed
21.2	Provide feedback on the "TANK Plan Change – Engagement Plan" to Drew as the convenor of the Engagement Working Group.	TANK members	
21.3	Bring back a firmer set of guidelines for working group membership including matters such as who gets to decide who joins the working groups and the roles of TANK plenary members, observers and other supporting experts.	HBRC project team	Completed See Briefs on portal
21.4	Discuss the process around a spokesperson(s) further and report back with further clarification, including working with the mana whenua group.	Drew/ Engagement WG	To be considered by WG
21.5	Provide the plenary group with a gap analysis that compares all the previous work that has been carried out for stormwater in the TANK catchment and identification of what work needs to be done	Rina/ Stormwater WG	In progress
21.6	Compose and provide to the plenary group a reading list to read to come up to speed on information available.	Rina	In progress
21.7	HBRC to clarify the locations of the Poporangi and Ohara Streams.	Mary-Anne	Completed. See GIS map
21.8	HBRC to check whether swimability is a compulsory value in the RPS everywhere all of the time.	Mary-Anne	Refer Meeting record

Tūtaekuri Values



Tutaekuri Catchment Values

Location	Values	Comments	
All water - surface and groundwater	Mauri Life-supporting capacity Habitat and biodiversity - native fish, eels, plants and birds Trout fishery Household water supply Stock drinking water	Household water supply may need treatment because of natural water quality. This especially includes surface water, as there are animals and birds in the catchment.	
All surface water	Swimming/immersion Mahinga kai, Nohoanga Taonga raranga, taonga rongoa. Natural character and <u>Amenity</u> – (including wild and scenic value) as there is a high level of natural character Fishing - whitebait, eels, trout	Provision of access not part of this water quality management consideration Swimming not at flood flows or for urban streams High natural character values above Mangatutu R confluence.	
Surface - main stem and tributaries - and groundwater	Food and fibre production/ processing (and employment) Industrial and commercial use (and employment)		
Main stem	Tourism, Kayaking Rafting		
Main stem (specific lower reaches)	Gravel extraction		
Main stem and Mangaone R	Trout fishing		
Shallow lakes and wetlands	Commercial eeling ?		
Surface waters - tributaries	Small scale hydro-electric power generation		
Surface and groundwater	Direct discharges (including stormwater) and non-point source discharges	More details (consent data) about direct discharges are required before making a decision about the use of surface waters for discharge of contaminants	
Groundwater 7	Contribution to surface flows and water body values		

- Amendments include "amenity value"
- Other suggestion; land cover as value



Meeting 22 Ngaruroro and Tutaekuri catchments Water Quality

Meeting 22 Ngaruroro and Tutaekuri catchments Water Quality

General considerations and recap from last meeting
Tutaekuri catchment:

NOF attributes for toxicity (ecosystem health) and *E.coli* (contact recreation)

Ngaruroro and Tutaekuri catchments:

- Algae and nutrients
- Macroinvertebrates

Water clarity, sediment

Take home points from last meeting

- Progress too slow
- 'Happy/ unhappy' rating for current state not suitable
- Unknown uncertainty behind data
- Sometimes confusing

Changes to this presentation:

- Discussing attributes for Tutaekuri and Ngaruroro together
- Replacement of rating happy/ unhappy with current state by prioritising responses instead
- > Tables now sorted separately for main stem and tributaries (management zones?)
- Background information on the data
- > Ngaruroro macrophyte dominated lowland sites taken out of algae section

RESPONSE RATING (PRIORITY)	NARRATIVE
High	Water quality and/or quantity needs of the values are not being met or There is a high risk that values will be significantly adversely affected without management intervention
Medium	Water quality and quantity needs of the values are not being fully met or There is a risk that values will be adversely affected without management intervention
Low	Water quality and quantity needs of the values are being mostly met or There is a low risk that values will be adversely affected or Management response required for other priority areas may manage this aspect at higher level of protection
No	Water quality and quantity needs of the values are being fully met and There is a very low risk that values will be adversely affected

Site name	E.coli	NO_3	Amm-N	Chla	PeriWCC	MPh	DIN	TN	DRP	TP	Bdisk	Furbidity	MCI
Ngaruroro catchment													
Ngaruroro Rv at Kuripapango	Α	Α	Α				Α	Α	Α	Α	В	В	Е
*Taruarau Rv	Α	Α	Α	Α	Α		Α	Α	Α	Α	В	Α	E
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanawhana	Α	А	Α	В	В		Α	Α	Α	Α	С	В	G
*Poporangi Strm	Α	Α	Α	В	В		D	D	F	С	С	С	G
Ngaruroro Rv U/S HB Dairies	Α	Α	Α	С	Α		Α	Α	Α	Α	С	В	G
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Dairies	Α	Α	Α	В	Α		Α	Α	Α	В	D	С	G
*Maraekakaho Strm	Α	В	Α		Р		С	D	F	С	С	В	G
Ngaruroro Rv at Ohiti	Α	Α	В	В			В	Α	Α	В	D	D	G
Waitio Strm	В	Α	В	В	В		С	С	F	С	С	Α	G-F
*Ohiwia Strm	С	Α	Α				D	D	F	F	С	В	F
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill	Α	Α	Α	В	В		В	В	Α	В	D	С	F
Ngaruroro Rv at Motorway	Α	Α	Α	В	В		В	В	Α	В	D	С	G-F
Tutaekuri-Waimate Strm	В	Α	Α				С	С	F	F	E	С	F
Ngaruroro Rv at Chesterhope NIWA	Α	Α	Α				В	В		С	D	С	G
			Tu	taeku	ri catch	ment							
Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	Α	Α	Α	Α	Α		Α	Α	Α	Α	Α	A	Е
*Mangatutu Strm	Α	Α	Α		D		С	С	F	В	D	В	G
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	Α	Α	В	В	Α		В	В	D	В	D	В	G
Mangaone Rv at Rissington	Α	Α	Α	В	Α		С	С	F	С	С	Α	G
*Mangaone Rv at Dartmoor	Α	Α	Α				В	В	F	D	С	Α	G
*Tutaekuri Rv at Puketapu	Α	Α	Α	С	Α		В	В	E	В	С	Α	F
Tutaekuri Rv at Brookfields Br	Α	Α	Α	D	Α		В	В	E	В	С	В	F
		k	karamu	and A	huriri c	atchm	ents						
Ruahapia Strm	С	Α	В				D	D	F	F	E	С	Р
Karewarewa Strm	С	С	С				E	F	F	F	D	С	Р
Awanui Strm	В	В	В				E	F	F	F	D	В	Р
Poukawa Strm	Α	Α	Α				С	F	F	F	D	Α	Р
Herehere Strm	D	В	Α				С	D	F	F	С	С	Р
Mangarau Strm at Keirunga Rd	В	Α	Α	D			В	С	F	F	E	С	F
Mangarau Strm at Te Aute Rd	В	В	Α	С			F	F	F	F	E	В	Р
Clive Rv	В	В	Α				D	D	F	F	D	В	Р
Taipo Strm	С	Α	С				D	E	F	F	F	D	Р

Attribute groups of similar response to management



NOF attributes: aims in NOF bands

Compulsory attributes for ecosystem health and human health (recreation)- Tutaekuri catchment



Nitrate toxicity on aquatic organisms, Tutaekuri catchment

Guideline source:	NOF band		
Attribute/Indicator:	Nitrate NO3-N (mg /L)		
Value:	Ecosystem Health	Ecosystem Health	
	Toxicity	Toxicity	
Statistic:	Annual median	Annual 95th %ile	
Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	А	А	
*Mangatutu Strm	(A)	(A)	
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	А	А	
Mangaone Rv at Rissington	А	А	
*Mangaone Rv at Dartmoor	(A)	(A)	
*Tutaekuri Rv at Puketapu	(A)	(A)	
Tutaekuri Rv at Brookfields Br	A	A	

NOF narrative state

High conservation value system. Unlikely to be effects even on sensitive species.

Ammonia toxicity on aquatic organisms, Tutaekuri catchment

Guideline source:	NOF band		
Attribute/Indicator:	Ammonia NH4-N (mg/L)		
	Ecosystem	Ecosystem	
Value:	Health	Health	
	Toxicity	Toxicity	
Statistic:	Median	Maximum	
Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	А	В	
*Mangatutu Strm	(A)	(A)	
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	А	В	
Mangaone Rv at Rissington	А	А	
*Mangaone Rv at Dartmoor	(A)	(A)	
*Tutaekuri Rv at Puketapu	(A)	(A)	
Tutaekuri Rv at Brookfields Br	A	A	

NOF narrative state

99% species protection level: No observed effect on any species tested.

95% species protection level:Starts impacting occasionally on the5% most sensitive species.

Sites in B band only marginally over threshold A-B: 0.05 mg/L

- Tutaekuri at Lawrence Hut: 1 sample in 5 years 0.055 mg/L
- Tutaekuri U/S Mangaone : 1 sample in 5 years 0.053 mg/L

Ammonia toxicity on aquatic organisms, Tutaekuri catchment

Data within NOF A-band, 2 sites with maximum ammonia concentration *marginally* in B band

Attribute State	Annual Maximum*	Ngaruroro	Narrative State
А	≤ 0.05	All sites except:	99% species protection level: No observed effect on any species tested.
В	> 0.05 and ≤ 0.4	Tutaekuri Lawrence Hut Tutaekuri U/S Mangaone	95% species protection level: Starts impacting occasionally on the 5% most sensitive species.
С	> 0.40 and ≤ 2.20	-	80% species protection level: Starts impacting regularly on the 20% most sensitive species (reduced survival of most sensitive species)
D	> 2.2	-	Starts approaching acute impact level (ie risk of death) for sensitive species 18





Overview nitrate and ammonia NOF bands Tutaekuri catchment

Guideline source:	NOF band		NOF	band		
Attribute/Indicator:	Nitrate NO	Nitrate NO3-N (mg /L)		H4-N (mg/L)	Priority level	Priority level
Value:	Ecosystem Health Toxicity	Ecosystem Health Toxicity	Ecosystem Health Toxicity	Ecosystem Health Toxicity	Tutaekuri main stem	Tributaries
Statistic:	Annual median	Annual 95th %ile	Median	Maximum		
Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	А	А	А	В		
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	А	А	А	В	No	
*Tutaekuri Rv at Puketapu	(A)	(A)	(A)	(A)	priority	
Tutaekuri Rv at Brookfields Br	А	А	А	А		
*Mangatutu Strm	(A)	(A)	(A)	(A)		No
Mangaone Rv at Rissington	A	A	A	A		nriority
*Mangaone Rv at Dartmoor	(A)	(A)	(A)	(A)		priority

Guideline source:	NOF	band	NOF band		
Attribute/Indicator:	Nitrate (mg/L)		Ammoni	ia (mg/L)	
Value:	Ecosystem Health Toxicity	Ecosystem Health Toxicity	Ecosystem Health Toxicity	Ecosystem Health Toxicity	
Statistic:	Annual median	Annual 95th %ile	Median	Maximum	
Ngaruroro Rv at Kuripapango NIWA	А	А	А	А	
*Taruarau Rv	А	(A)	А	(A)	
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanawhana	А	А	А	А	
Ngaruroro Rv U/S HB Dairies	А	А	А	А	
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Dairies	А	А	А	А	
Ngaruroro Rv at Ohiti	А	А	А	В	
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill	А	А	А	В	
Ngaruroro Rv at Motorway	А	А	А	А	
Ngaruroro Rv at Chesterhope NIWA	А	А	А	А	
*Poporangi Strm	А	(A)	А	(A)	
*Maraekakaho Strm	А	(B)	А	(A)	
Waitio Strm	A	A	A	В	
*Ohiwa Strm	A	(A)	A	(A)	
Tutaekuri-Waimate Strm	A	A	A	В	

Ammonia toxicity on aquatic organisms, Ngaruroro catchment













Overview nitrate and ammonia NOF bands Ngaruroro catchment

Guideline source:	NOF	band	NOF	band		
Attribute/Indicator:	Nitrata (mg/l)		Ammonia (mg/L)		Priority	Priority
Attribute/Indicator.	Nitrate	(IIIg/L)	Ammonia (mg/L)		level	level
	Ecosystem	Ecosystem	Ecosystem	Ecosystem	upper	
Value:	Health	Health	Health	Health	Ngaruroro &	Tributaries
	Toxicity	Toxicity	Toxicity	Toxicity	main stem	
Statistic:	Annual median	Annual 95th %ile	Median	Maximum		
Ngaruroro Rv at Kuripapango NIWA	А	А	А	А		
*Taruarau Rv	А	(A)	А	(A)		
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanawhana	А	А	А	А		
Ngaruroro Rv U/S HB Dairies	А	А	А	А	No	
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Dairies	А	А	А	А	priority	
Ngaruroro Rv at Ohiti	А	А	А	В		
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill	А	А	А	В		
Ngaruroro Rv at Motorway	А	А	А	А		
Ngaruroro Rv at Chesterhope NIWA	А	А	А	А		
*Poporangi Strm	А	(A)	А	(A)		No
*Maraekakaho Strm	А	(B)	А	(A)		Low
Waitio Strm	А	A	А	В		Low
*Ohiwa Strm	А	(A)	А	(A)		No
Tutaekuri-Waimate Strm	A	A	A	В		Low

Contact recreation/ human health: E. coli in the Tutaekuri catchment

Guideline source:	NOF			
Attribute/Indicator:	<i>E. coli</i> (CF	Priority level	Priority level	
Value:	Recreation e.g. boating: Occasional immersion	Recreation e.g. swimming: Full immersion	Tutaekuri main stem	Tributaries
Statistic:	Annual median	Annual 95th %ile		
Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	А	А		
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	А	А	No	
*Tutaekuri Rv at Puketapu	(A)	(A)	priority	
Tutaekuri Rv at Brookfields Br	А	А		
*Mangatutu Strm	(A)	(A)		No
Mangaone Rv at Rissington	A	А		nriority
*Mangaone Rv at Dartmoor	(A)	(A)		priority

NOF narrative state

People are exposed to a **very low risk** of infection (less than 0.1% risk).



Contact recreation/ human health: E. coli in the Ngaruroro catchment

Guideline source:		NOF							
Attribute/Indicator: Value:		: <i>E. coli</i> (CFU/100ml)		To calcu	ecreation:				
		Recreation e.g. boating: Occasional immersion	Recreation e.g. swimming: Full immersion	 95th Calci 	 95th percentile Calculated for swimming season No 				 95th percentile Calculated for swimming season
Statistic		Annual median	Annual 95th %ile*	 Flood flows excluded (<media< li=""> → This reduces the dataset! </media<>	 Flood flows excluded (<median fl<="" li=""> → This reduces the dataset! Needs > 10 samples ideally 20 </median>	 Flood flows excluded (<median flow)<="" li=""> → This reduces the dataset! Needs >10 samples_ideally 30 </median>			
Ngaruroro Rv at Kuripapa	ango NIWA	А			15 >10 samples, lu	bighor with los			
*Taruarau Rv		А	(A)	• 95**	percentile can be	nigher with les	s uala		
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanaw	vhana	А	А	• Iried	 Tried with two datasets but both return D 				
*Poporangi Strm		А	(A)						
Ngaruroro Rv U/S HB Dai	ries	А							
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Daii	ries	А	А						
*Maraekakaho Strm		А	(A)		- norrativo stato				
Ngaruroro Rv at Ohiti		А		NO					
Waitio Strm		А	А						
*Ohiwia Strm		А	(D)	Peo Peo	ple are expose	d to a			
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill		А	А	mo	derate to high i	risk of			
Ngaruroro Rv at Motorwa	ау	А		info	ction				
Tutaekuri-Waimate Strm		А	D						
Ngaruroro Rv at Chesterhope NIWA		А		(gre	ater than 5% ri	sk).			
NOF narrative state People are very low r (less than		exposed to a sk of infection 0.1% risk).	People are ex low risk of in (up to 1% risk	xposed to a fection k).	*2011 to 2015	i data			

Contact recreation/ human health: E. coli in the Ngaruroro catchment

Guideline source:	NOF band			
Attribute/Indicator:	E. coli (CFU/100ml)		Priority	Priority
			level	level
	Recreation	Recreation	upper	
Value:	e.g. boating:	e.g. swimming:	Ngaruroro &	Tributaries
	Occasional immersion	Full immersion	main stem	
Statistic:	Annual median	Annual 95th %ile*		
Ngaruroro Rv at Kuripapango NIWA	А			
*Taruarau Rv	А	(A)		
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanawhana	А	А		
Ngaruroro Rv U/S HB Dairies	А		No	
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Dairies	А	А	priority	
Ngaruroro Rv at Ohiti	А			
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill	А	А		
Ngaruroro Rv at Motorway	А			
Ngaruroro Rv at Chesterhope NIWA	А			
*Poporangi Strm	А	(A)		No
*Maraekakaho Strm	A	(A)		No
Waitio Strm	A	A		No
*Ohiwa Strm	A	(D)		
Tutaekuri-Waimate Strm	A	D		

Red triangles: sites discontinued in 2012

Discussion and Feedback

- Do you agree with the response rating (priorities)?
 - for toxicity (ammonia, nitrate)
 - for recreation, human health (E.coli)
- Swimming values: does primary contact recreation apply to the tributaries (e.g. Waitio, Tutaekuri-Waimate)?



Management of Algae

Objective for this session;

 Response ratings (prioritisation) are agreed on where needs of values are not met

Format of session

- Presentation of algae (trophic level) states in relation to NOF bands
- Presentation of algae state in relation to other guidelines for values (recreation and other values)
- Phormidium
- Algal biomass in context with nutrients
- TANK group discussion/question session
- Discussion on priorities





DIN


DRP



Algae biomass at SOE sites Ngaruroro and Tutaekuri



	ATTRIBUTE / PERFORMANCE MEASURE	VALUE
NOF	Algal biomass	 Trophic state (ecosystem health)
NIWA	Algal cover index (%PeriWCC)	Ecosystem healthAngling, recreation
MfE	Phormidium cover	Human/ animal health



Filamentous algae Mats

(may include Phormidium)

- Natural algal community, variability, role
- When do they turn into an impact?

Summary of Algae in the Ngaruroro catchment Algae dominated sites only

Guideline source:	NOF band
Attribute/Indicator:	Algal biomass (mg Chl- <i>a</i> /m ²)
Value:	Ecosystem health Trophic state
Statistic:	Frequency of exceedance
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanawhana	А
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Dairies	A
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill	A

Rare blooms reflecting negligible nutrient enrichment and/or alteration of the natural flow regime or habitat.

Dataset: Jan 2013 to Dec 2015 Monthly samples

Algae in the Tutaekuri catchment: biomass (NOF)

Guideline source:	NOF band
Attribute/Indicator:	Algal biomass (mg Chl- <i>a</i> /m ²)
Value:	Ecosystem health Trophic state
Statistic:	Frequency of exceedance
Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	А
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	В
Mangaone Rv at Rissington	(B)

Rare blooms reflecting negligible nutrient enrichment and/or alteration of the natural flow regime or habitat.

Occasional blooms reflecting low nutrient enrichment and/or alteration of the natural flow regime or habitat.

Dataset: Jan 2013 to Dec 2015 Monthly samples

Algal and aquatic plant growth

Values Light Phosphorus **ECOSYSTEM HEALTH** (DRP) Substrate **RECREATION**, size **AESTHETICS Guidelines/thresholds** SOCIAL, CULTURAL Resetting flows Nitrogen (DIN) ECONOMIC, Temperature TOURISM

- Algal thresholds link to values
- Nutrients link to algal growth, but not directly to values

Nutrient management DIN and DRP (Ngaruroro co-limited) 2 options: against guidelines or relative to current state of algal growth?

Algal cover on stream bed (%PeriWCC)

Annual maximum %PeriWCC Filaments + (mats /2)

Attribute State	Ecological condition (% PeriWCC)	Recreation/ Aesthetics (%PeriWCC)	
Excellent	< 20%	< 30%	
Good	20 to 39%	< 30%	
Fair	40 to 55%	> 20%/	
Poor	> 55%	> 50%	

Summary of Algae in the Ngaruroro catchment Algae dominated sites only

Guideline source:	NOF band	NIWA	NIWA	NIWA
Attribute/Indicator:	Algal biomass $(mg.Chl.g.(m^2))$	Algal cover	Algal cover	Algal cover
Value:	Ecosystem health Trophic state	Ecological condition	Aesthetics / recreation	(/// / / / / / / / / / / / / / / / / /
Statistic:	Frequency of exceedance	Average maxima over 3 years	Average maxima 3 years (30%PWCC)	Max 3 years
*Taruarau Rv	N/D	Good	< 30%	25%
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanawhana	А	Good	> 30%	34%
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Dairies	А	Good	> 30%	36%
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill	А	Good	> 30%	40%
*Poporangi Strm	N/D	Excellent	< 30%	16%
*Maraekakaho Strm	N/D	Poor	> 30%	67%

- Main stem: Moderate increase algal cover from upstream to downstream, maintains good ecosystem condition.
- Sometimes exceeds recreation values
- Poporangi: shaded site.
- Maraekakaho: algae and aquatic plants (macrophytes).
- PeriWCC mats proportion Phormidium?

Summary of algae in the Tutaekuri catchment

Guideline source: NOF ban		NIWA	NIWA	NIWA
Attribute/Indicator:	Algal biomass (mg Chl- <i>a</i> /m ²)	Algal cover (%PeriWCC)	Algal cover (%PeriWCC)	Algal cover (%PeriWCC)
Value:	Ecosystem health Trophic state	Ecological condition	Aesthetics / recreation	
Statistic:	Frequency of exceedance	Average maxima over 3 years	Average maxima 3 years (30%PWCC)	Average maxima 3 years (30%PWCC)
Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	А	Excellent	<30%	8%
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	В	Good	>30%	31%
*Tutaekuri Rv at Puketapu		Good	<30%	23%
Tutaekuri Rv at Brookfields Br		Good	>30%	30%
*Mangatutu Strm		Excellent	<30%	17%
Mangaone Rv at Rissington (B)		Excellent	<30%	1%
*Mangaone Rv at Dartmoor		Excellent	<30%	7%

> Main stem: moderate increase in algae cover, maintains good ecosystem condition.

- > Mangaone River: small gravel that does not support large algal biomass
- Mangatutu: Algae are mainly mats, PeriWCC counts ½ cover of mats. 87% total algal cover in 2013; mats include Phormidium: >80% in total algal cover.
- See Phormidium next slide

Algal cover: Filaments and mats



Sometimes mats can be mostly Phormidium, → But in PeriWCC counted as ½ the impact

Algal cover: Filaments and mats



Phormidium (cyanobacteria):

- 20% cover guideline: Risk-based alert trigger for recreation/health (compare *E.coli*). Mats are not always toxic precautionary approach.
- Response to environmental factors not fully understood yet (current research!). Very variable between years and spatially! (Cover and toxicity)
- Management options not fully known but influencing factors nutrients and flow.
- Needs definition where recreation/health value applies



Dataset: same as PeriWCC, filtered for % Phormidium cover



Algal and aquatic plant growth



Sometimes we don't measure high algal growth when nutrients are high Or low algal growth when nutrients are low:

Also depends on

- Growth stage of algae (fastest growth? mature?)
- Flow (shallow water, slow flow: more efficient nutrient uptake)
- Substrate (stable?)

DRP at SOE sites Ngaruroro and Tuatekuri



DRP at SOE sites Ngaruroro and Tuatekuri



DIN at SOE sites Ngaruroro and Tutaekuri

DIN at SOE sites Ngaruroro and Tutaekuri

Also high nutrient tributaries: Waitio, Ohiwa, Tutaekuri-Waimate (macrophytes)

Algae biomass at SOE sites Ngaruroro and Tuatekuri

Less algal biomass in lower Ngaruroro than lower Tutaekuri.

- Upstream HB Dairies, Mangaone, Poporangi: At some sites algal biomass results are different from what would be expected from nutrient concentration.
- Sample size differences= uncertainty in comparison: Whanawhana, d/s HBD and Fernhill true long term sites with monthly samples

Algal and aquatic plant growth

Sometimes we don't measure high algal growth when nutrients are high Or low algal growth when nutrients are low:

Also depends on

- Growth stage of algae (fastest growth? mature?)
- Flow (shallow water, slow flow: more efficient nutrient uptake)
- Substrate (stable?)

Summary for algae, nutrients (Ngaruroro catchment)

Attribute	Value	State summary, notes
Algae (NOF: biomass) (NIWA: cover)	NOF: ecosystem health NIWA: ecosystem health, recreation, aesthetics	 NOF A-band (excellent) at 3 key site measured in Ngaruroro main stem: Rare blooms reflecting negligible nutrient enrichment and/or alteration of flow and habitat. NIWA algal cover index: Occasional exceedances for contact recreation/aesthetics in mid and low main stem and 1 tributary (long accrual periods) Algal cover indicating good ecological condition in Ngaruroro main stem, excellent in Poporangi (at a shaded site), poor in Maraekakaho Other tributaries not suitable for periphyton assessment, see macrophytes
Aquatic plants (NIWA)	ecosystem health, recreation, trout fishery	Exceedances in tributaries
Nutrients DIN and DRP	Indirect effect on values. Direct effect on algal and macrophyte growth.	 Low nutrient concentration in Ngaruroro main stem High nutrient concentration in tributaries, contribution to main stem Long accrual periods (long algal growth periods) increase risk for blooms even when nutrient concentration low

Summary for algae, nutrients (Tutaekuri catchment)

Attribute	Value	State summary, notes
Algae (NOF: biomass)	NOF: ecosystem health	 NOF A-band (excellent) at Tutaekuri Lawrence Hut: Rare blooms reflecting negligible nutrient enrichment and/or alteration of flow and habitat. NOF B-band upstream Mangaone confluence and Mangaone at Rissington: Occasional blooms reflecting low nutrient enrichment and/or alteration of the natural flow regime or habitat.
Algae (NIWA: cover)	NIWA: ecosystem health, recreation, aesthetics	 NIWA algal cover index: Occasional exceedances for contact recreation/aesthetics in mid and low main stem (long accrual periods) Algal cover indicating good ecological condition in Tutaekuri main stem, excellent in the tributaries (Mangaone: fine gravel unsuitable for extensive algal growth)
Nutrients DIN and DRP	<i>Indirect</i> effect on values. Direct effect on algal growth.	 Low nutrient concentration in the upper Tutaekuri, increasing downstream, exceeding guidelines in lower main stem Higher nutrient concentration in tributaries, contribution to main stem Long accrual periods (long algal growth periods) increase risk for blooms even when nutrient concentration low

Summary of Algae in the Ngaruroro and Tutaekuri catchments

Cuidalia a sugar	NOT hand						
Guideline source:	NOF band		INIWA	NIWA	INI WA		
Attribute/Indicator:	Algal biomass	%	Algal cover	Algal cover	Phormidium	Priority	Priority
	(mg Chl- <i>a</i> /m ²)	PeriWCC	(%PeriWCC)	(%PeriWCC)	(% cover)	level	level
Value:	Ecosystem health Trophic state		Ecological condition	Aesthetics / recreation	Recreation/ health	upper Ngaruroro & main stem	Tributaries
Statistic:	Frequency of exceedance	Max avge 3 years	Average maxima over 3 years	Average maxima 3 years	Maximum		
*Taruarau Rv		25%	Good	< 30%	5%		
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanawhana	А	34%	Good	> 30%	21%		
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Dairies	А	36%	Good	> 30%	31%	LOW	
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill	А	40%	Good	> 30%	0%		
*Poporangi Strm		16%	Excellent	< 30%	90%		Modium
*Maraekakaho Strm		67%	Poor	> 30%	3%		wieululli

Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	А	8%	Excellent	<30%	1%	Low	
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	В	31%	Good	>30%	1%		
*Tutaekuri Rv at Puketapu		23%	Good	<30%	10%	Medium	
Tutaekuri Rv at Brookfields Br	2013: 460 mg/L	30%	Good	>30%	18%	wiculum	
*Mangatutu Strm	2013: 590 mg/L	17%	Excellent	<30%	81%		
Mangaone Rv at Rissington	(B)	1%	Excellent	<30%	2%		Medium
*Mangaone Rv at Dartmoor		7%	Excellent	<30%	1%		

Discussion and feedback

- Algal biomass and cover in relation to values ecosystem health, recreation and aesthetics and human health
- > Agreement on response rating for the Ngaruroro and Tutaekuri catchments

Macroinvertebate community index (MCI)

Tolerant taxa \rightarrow low MCI score Sensitive taxa "EPT taxa" \rightarrow high MCI score

Macroinvertebrates are aquatic bugs

The community at a site indicates good ecological condition when

- many different bugs are present (diversity)
- A high proportion of sensitive species is present (high score)

MCI

Macroinvertebrate Community Index

Factors influencing MCI

- Organic pollution / oxygen
- Temperature
- Habitat (clean gravel, habitat variability)
- Toxicants (e.g. ammonia, nitrate)
- ➢ Flow

Macroinvertebrate community index, Ngaruroro catchment

Guideline source:	Stark et al. 2007
Attribute/Indicator:	MCI (index)
Value:	Ecosystem health indicator
Statistic:	5-year average
Ngaruroro Rv at Kuripapango NIWA	Excellent
*Taruarau Rv	(Excellent)
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanawhana	Good
Ngaruroro Rv U/S HB Dairies	Good
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Dairies	Good
Ngaruroro Rv at Ohiti	Good
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill	Fair
Ngaruroro Rv at Motorway	Good to Fair
Ngaruroro Rv at Chesterhope NIWA	Good
*Poporangi Strm	(Good)
*Maraekakaho Strm	(Good)
Waitio Strm	Good to Fair
*Ohiwa Strm	(Fair)
Tutaekuri-Waimate Strm	Fair

Main stem: Possible factors for lower MCI Temperature, Sediment?

Lowland streams with macrophyte (aquatic plants) and fine sediment, but gravel bed.

Waitio: MCI 99, MCI-sb 97, Ohiwa: MCI 84, MCI-sb 80, Tut-Wai: MCI 78 MCI-sb 68

Summary Macroinvertebrate community index Tutaekuri catchment

Guideline source:	Stark et al. 2007
Attribute/Indicator:	MCI (index)
Value:	Ecosystem health indicator
Statistic:	5-year average
Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	Excellent
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	Good
*Tutaekuri Rv at Puketapu	(Fair)
Tutaekuri Rv at Brookfields Br	Fair
*Mangatutu Strm	(Good)
Mangaone Rv at Rissington	Good
*Mangaone Rv at Dartmoor	(Good)

Possible factors for lower MCI Temperature, Sediment?

Guideline source:	Stark et al. 2007		
Attribute/Indicator:	MCI (index)	Priority level	Priority level
Value:	Ecosystem health indicator	upper Ngaruroro & main stem	Tributaries
Statistic:	5-year average		
Ngaruroro Rv at Kuripapango NIWA	Excellent		
*Taruarau Rv	(Excellent)		
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanawhana	Good		
Ngaruroro Rv U/S HB Dairies	Good		
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Dairies	Good		
Ngaruroro Rv at Ohiti	Good		
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill	Fair		
Ngaruroro Rv at Motorway	Good to Fair		
Ngaruroro Rv at Chesterhope NIWA	Good		
*Poporangi Strm	(Good)		
*Maraekakaho Strm	(Good)		
Waitio Strm	Good to Fair		
*Ohiwa Strm	(Fair)		
Tutaekuri-Waimate Strm	Fair		

Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	Excellent	
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	Good	
*Tutaekuri Rv at Puketapu	(Fair)	
Tutaekuri Rv at Brookfields Br	Fair	
*Mangatutu Strm	(Good)	
Mangaone Rv at Rissington	Good	
*Mangaone Rv at Dartmoor	(Good)	

Summary MCI Ngaruroro and Tutaekuri catchments

Water Clarity and Turbidity

Objective for this session;

- Response ratings (prioritisation) are agreed on where needs of values are not met
- Revision when SedNet modelling results available

Format of session

Presentation of states in relation to guidelines and values

Water clarity and turbidity, deposited sediment

Particles from soil erosion (mainly) or point sources (e.g. sewage outfalls, stormwater)

Variable	Measurement
Visual Clarity	Measured as viewing distance (metres Black Disk distance)
Turbidity	'Cloudiness' of water (NTU): particles (clay, silt, organic matter) cause light scattering in water
Deposited sediment	(Sand, silt, mud) on stream bed (new protocol)

Water clarity and turbidity, deposited sediment

Impact on values

Clarity/visibility

- Recreation: Safety, aesthetics; Determines how well you see in the water
- Ecosystem health, fishery: Visibility determines success of fish catching prey (visual drift feeders like trout)

Amount of particles

- Clogging/destroying nets of filter feeders,
- Abrading, damaging gills.
- Fills stomach of filter feeders with indigestible silt/clay → less energy for growth, reproduction

Water clarity and turbidity, deposited sediment Impact on values

Tutaekuri at Lawrence Hut

Mangatutu

Tutaekuri at Brookfields Bridge

Impact on values

Clean sediment functions:

- Spaces between gravel and cobble are (1) habitat, (2) refuge during flood events and high temperature!
- Flow between gravel keeps temperatures cool (braided main stems)
- Exchange with groundwater
- Reaction surface for microorganisms (cleans water)

Water clarity and turbidity

Impact on estuarine values

Eelgrass

Phytoplankton

Clarity/visibility/ light penetration

- Recreation: Determines how well you see in the water
- Ecosystem health: Visibility determines success of fish catching prey
- Shift from eelgrass and macroalgae to phytoplankton and high turbidity

Amount of particles in the water:

- Clogs and abrades gills of filter feeders
- Filter feeders have to filter more → less energy for growth, reproduction

Deposited sediment Impact on estuarine values

Waitangi estuary

Waitangi estuary

Ahuriri Estuary

Deposited sediment:

- Change in substrate from gravel and sand (slide on left) to mud (centre slide) means change in species (SoE monitoring)
- Smothering of eelgrass and intertidal vegetation (left slide)
- Smothering of shellfish beds and other infauna (middle slide and SOE data)
- Anoxic layer at surface a sign of increasing fine sediment nothing can live in this (right slide) !



Deposited fine sediment cover Ngaruroro catchment



Deposited fine sediment cover Tutaekuri catchment



Summary water clarity and turbidity Ngaruroro catchment

Guideline source:		Hay et al. 2008	Hay et al. 2009	. 2009 ANZECC		ANZECC	apcott et a
Attribute/Indicator:		Black Disc viewing	Black Disc viewing	Black Disc viewing		Turbidity (NTU)	
		distance (metres)	distance (metres)	distance (metres)		trigger	
Value:	Black disk (m)	Outstanding trout fishery	Significant trout fishery	Contact recreation (1.6 m)	Turbidity (NTU)	Ecosystem health	Deposited sediment (%)
Statistic:	median all flows	Median (threshold 5m)	Median (threshold 3.5m)	Median (threshold 1.6m)	median all flows	Median (Upland 4.1 NTU Lowland 5.6 NTU)	Average (3 years)
Ngaruroro Rv at Kuripapango NIWA	5.3	>5m	> 3.5 m	>1.6 m	0.8	< 4.1	
*Taruarau Rv	4.7	(< 5m)	(> 3.5 m)	(> 1.6 m)	1.4	(< 4.1)	15
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanawhana	2.4	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	>1.6 m	2.1	< 5.6	6
Ngaruroro Rv U/S HB Dairies	2.4	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	>1.6 m	2.2	< 5.6	35
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Dairies	1.2	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	4.5	< 5.6	9
Ngaruroro Rv at Ohiti	0.8	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	6.4	> 5.6	13
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill	1.2	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	5.2	< 5.6	5
Ngaruroro Rv at Motorway	1.0	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	4.9	< 5.6	13
Ngaruroro Rv at Chesterhope NIWA	1.3	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	3.4	< 5.6	
*Poporangi Strm	1.7	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	(>1.6 m)	2.1	(< 5.6)	9
*Maraekakaho Strm	3.4	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	(>1.6 m)	0.7	(< 5.6)	7
Waitio Strm	3.0	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	>1.6 m	1.2	< 5.6	5
*Ohiwa Strm	3.0	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	(>1.6 m)	1.9	(< 5.6)	33
Tutaekuri-Waimate Strm	1.1	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	5.1	< 5.6	38

Summary water clarity and turbidity Tutaekuri main stem and tributaries

Guideline source:		Hay et al. 2008	Hay et al. 2009	ANZECC		ANZECC	apcott et a
Attribute/Indicator:		Black Disc viewing distance (metres)	Black Disc viewing distance (metres)	Black Disc viewing distance (metres)		Turbidity (NTU) trigger	
Value:	Black disk (m)	Outstanding trout fishery	Significant trout fishery	Contact recreation (1.6 m)	Turbidity (NTU)	Ecosystem health	Deposited sediment (%)
Statistic:	median all flows	Median (threshold 5m)	Median (threshold 3.5m)	Median (threshold 1.6m)	median all flows	Median (Upland 4.1 NTU Lowland 5.6 NTU)	Average (3 years)
Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	5.9	> 5m	> 3.5 m	>1.6 m	0.8	< 4.1	2.8
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	1.5	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	2.7	< 5.6	13.7
*Tutaekuri Rv at Puketapu	2.8	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	> 1.6 m	1.8	(< 5.6)	2.0
Tutaekuri Rv at Brookfields Br	1.9	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	> 1.6 m	2.2	< 5.6	24.0
*Mangatutu Strm	1.4	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	(< 1.6 m)	2.8	(< 5.6)	17.2
Mangaone Rv at Rissington	2	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	>1.6 m	2	< 5.6	11.4
*Mangaone Rv at Dartmoor	2	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	> 1.6 m	2.3	(< 5.6)	19.4

Deposited sediment



- 12 months data 2014
- Estuarine conditions reflect freshwater inputs
- Load more important than concentration to look at impacts on coastal environment





Summary clarity, turbidity and deposited sediment Discussion and feedback

Guideline source:		Hay et al. 2008	Hay et al. 2009	ANZECC		ANZECC apcott et al.			
Attribute/Indicator:		Black Disc viewing	Black Disc viewing	Black Disc viewing		Turbidity (NTU)		Priority	Priority
Attribute/Indicator.		distance (metres)	distance (metres)	distance (metres)		trigger		level	level
Value:	Black disk (m)	Outstanding	Significant	t Contact recreation Turbidity ry (1.6 m) (NTU)	Turbidity		Deposited	upper	
		trout fishery	trout fishery		Ecosystem health	sediment	Ngaruroro &	Tributaries	
						Median	(%)	main stem	
Statistic:	median all	Median (threshold 5m)	Median (threshold 3.5m)	Median (threshold 1.6m)	median all flows	(Upland 4.1 NTU	U Average (3 years)		
	flows					Lowland 5.6 NTU)			
Ngaruroro Rv at Kuripapango NIWA	5.3	>5m	> 3.5 m	> 1.6 m	0.8	< 4.1			
*Taruarau Rv	4.7	(< 5m)	(> 3.5 m)	(>1.6 m)	1.4	(< 4.1)	15		
Ngaruroro Rv at Whanawhana	2.4	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	> 1.6 m	2.1	< 5.6	6		
Ngaruroro Rv U/S HB Dairies	2.4	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	> 1.6 m	2.2	< 5.6	35		
Ngaruroro Rv D/S HB Dairies	1.2	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	4.5	< 5.6	9		
Ngaruroro Rv at Ohiti	0.8	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	6.4	> 5.6	13		
Ngaruroro Rv at Fernhill	1.2	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	5.2	< 5.6	5		
Ngaruroro Rv at Motorway	1.0	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	4.9	< 5.6	13		
Ngaruroro Rv at Chesterhope NIWA	1.3	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	3.4	< 5.6			
*Poporangi Strm	1.7	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	(> 1.6 m)	2.1	(< 5.6)	9		
*Maraekakaho Strm	3.4	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	(> 1.6 m)	0.7	(< 5.6)	7		
Waitio Strm	3.0	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	> 1.6 m	1.2	< 5.6	5		
*Ohiwa Strm	3.0	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	(> 1.6 m)	1.9	(< 5.6)	33		
Tutaekuri-Waimate Strm	1.1	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	5.1	< 5.6	38		
Tutaekuri Rv at Lawrence Hut	5.9	>5m	> 3.5 m	> 1.6 m	0.8	< 4.1	2.8		
Tutaekuri Rv U/S Mangaone Rv	1.5	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	< 1.6 m	2.7	< 5.6	13.7		
*Tutaekuri Rv at Puketapu	2.8	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	> 1.6 m	1.8	(< 5.6)	2.0		
Tutaekuri Rv at Brookfields Br	1.9	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	> 1.6 m	2.2	< 5.6	24.0		
*Mangatutu Strm	1.4	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	(< 1.6 m)	2.8	(< 5.6)	17.2		
Mangaone Rv at Rissington	2	< 5 m	< 3.5 m	> 1.6 m	2	< 5.6	11.4		
*Mangaone Rv at Dartmoor	2	(< 5m)	(< 3.5 m)	> 1.6 m	2.3	(< 5.6)	19.4		

Sediment sources



Sediment sources:

- land use activities
- cliffs on main stem

SedNet modelling

- Where does it come from?
- What can we manage?

SOE site Ngaruroro at Whanawhana

Potential available indicators (with thresholds) to come



Verbal updates from Working Groups

- Engagement
- Economic Assessments
- Stormwater
- Wetlands/Lakes
- Tangata whenua



83

Update on Water Conservation Order

Process plan and timeframes



84

BBN (Bayesian Belief Network)

- 1. The BBN:
 - Tool to communicate complex science and technical information
 - Organises science knowledge and integrates it with other knowledge in a decision making framework.
- 2. Focus of further development ;
 - Sediment loads in rivers and delivered to estuaries
 - Managing the Karamu
 - Managing the Ahuriri
 - Setting minimum flows
 - Managing e.coli levels in surface water
 - Periphyton management



Update from the RPC Meeting 3 August 2016

An update was given on the TANK Iwi/Hapu Enagement Plan

Key points included:

- A meeting has been coordinated with Te Manaaki Taiao to work together to finalise this important piece of work as a priority.
- NKII have been contracted to deliver the "Translating Mana Whenua Values to Attributes for the Ngaruroro Awa" study.
 - The estimated completed date is 8 September 2016
 - A presentation will be given by NKII to the next TANK Group (20 September)



Update from the RPC Meeting 3 August 2016

The following SOE technical reports were presented by HBRC scientists:

- State of the Hawke's Bay Coastal Environment: 2008 2013
- Ngaruroro, Tutaekuri, Karamu and Ahuriri Estuary Catchments State and Trends of River Water Quality and Ecology 2004-2013

The results from these reports are what Sandy has been presenting.

The reports are now available on the TANK Portal

